AUG 31 192

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

No. 32—October Term, 1923.

WILLIAM R. WARNER & COMPANY,
Petitioner,

vs.

ELI LILLY & COMPANY,
Respondent.

CERTIORARI TO THE CIRCUIT COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE THIRD CIRCUIT.

PETITIONER'S BRIEF

FRANCIS RAWLE,
GEORGE W. WICKERSHAM,
ROGER S. BALDWIN,
JOSEPH W. HENDERSON,
Counsel for Petitioner.

Ivers, Inc., 165 William Street, New York City.

INDEX

Outline of Argument.

PAGE

Statement 1

Assignments of Error..... 10

Argument:

I. The entire record is before the Court..... 13

II. In so far as the facts were found concurrently by both Courts below, they will be accepted as conclusive in this Court unless error is clearly shown 15

III. On the issue of unfairness of manner of competition, this Court must analyze the evidence and make its own conclusions, since the findings of the two Courts below on this issue are utterly at variance with one another 18

IV. The facts and the law are so interwoven that an analysis of the evidence by this Court is unavoidable 21

V. The competition offered by petitioner is not unfair 23

VI. Petitioner cannot be held responsible for the acts of certain druggists in passing off its product for respondent's..... 34

—inherent improbability of respondent's case (36-39); training of petitioner's salesmen was ethical (39-41); respondent's witnesses on unfair trade were stale (41-45).

PAGE

Analysis of evidence as to conduct of petitioner's salesmen 46
—petitioner's salesmen merely represented that Quin-Coco was the same as Coco-Quinine and cheaper in price, which was true (46-50); or that Quin-Coco was so closely identified with Coco-Quinine that one could be used in place of the other (51-59); no testimony of actual "passing off" (60-66); even discharged employees of petitioner, called by respondent, said their representations were that Quin-Coco was the same as Coco-Quinine, could be used in its place and was cheaper, which was true (66-77); druggists who admitted dishonest substitution did not testify to representations by petitioner's salesmen as an inducement therefor (78-79); testimony of ex-employees of petitioner showed no complicity on petitioner's part in "passing off" (79-85).

VII. There was a market for Quin-Coco and petitioner offered its product for sale in that market 86

VIII. The Circuit Court of Appeals erred in holding that unlawful practices were established; erred in holding that, if ever practiced by salesmen, their superiors sanctioned them; erred in holding fraudulent passing off was practiced extensively by druggists; and erred in admitting in rebuttal testimony which was properly part of respondent's *prima facie* case 89

PAGE

IX. Even if the Circuit Court of Appeals were right in finding petitioner guilty of using unfair selling methods in selling Quin-Coco, it was error to deprive petitioner of the exercise of its admitted right to duplicate respondent's product by a preparation of its own, by enjoining it from using chocolate in such preparation 106

X. Conclusion—the judgment of the Circuit Court of Appeals should be reversed and that of the District Court affirmed, or at least the judgment of the Circuit Court of Appeals should be modified so as to relieve petitioner from the injunction against using chocolate in the manufacture of its product "Quin-Coco" 116

Table of Cases.

PAGE

Adams v. Cowen, 174 U. S., 800; 177 id., 471..... 19
Adams v. Gilliland, 242 U. S., 350..... 19
Baker v. Cummings, 169 U. S., 189 16
Baker v. Schofield, 243 U. S., 114..... 17
Baker & Co. v. Gray, 192 Fed., 921..... 88
Bodkin v. Edwards, 255 U. S., 221 17
Bourgogne, La, 210 U. S., 95..... 16
Carib Prince, The, 170 U. S., 655..... 16
Carr & Sons v. Crisp & Co., 19 Rep. Pat. Cas., 497.. 41
Chadwick v. Covell, 151 Mass., 190..... 24
Chicago, B. & Q. Ry. Co. v. U. S., 220 U. S., 559..... 14
Coca-Cola Co. v. Gay-Ola Co., 200 Fed., 720; 211 id., 942 109
Compania La Flecha v. Brauer, 168 U. S., 104 15
Conqueror, The, 166 U. S., 110.....14, 15
Davis v. Schwartz, 155 U. S., 631..... 20
Delk v. St. Louis & S. F. R. Co., 220 U. S., 580..... 13
Fairbank Co. v. Bell Mfg. Co., 77 Fed., 869..... 114
Geddes v. Anaconda Copper Mining Co., 254 U. S., 590 17
Hall's Safe Co. v. Herring-Hall-Marvin Safe Co., 146 Fed., 37; 208 U. S., 554 114
Hostetter Co. v. Comerford, 97 Fed., 585 38
Hostetter v. Fries, 17 Fed., 620..... 24
Hygeia Distilled Water Co. v. Hygeia Ice Co., 70 Conn., 516 107
Jergens Co. v. Woodbury, 197 N. Y., 66..... 108
Jones Nat'l Bank v. Yates, 240 U. S., 541..... 22
Lever v. Goodwin, 57 L. T. N. S., 583..... 111
Lever Bros., Ltd., v. Masbro' Eq. Pioneers Soc., Ltd., 29 Rep. Pat. Cas., 225 41
Lutcher & Moore Co. v. Knight, 217 U. S., 257.....13, 14

PAGE

Meriden Brittania Co. v. Parker, 39 Conn., 450..... 108
Meyer v. Dr. Bull Vegetable Medicine Co., 58 Fed., 884 112
Moorewood v. Enequist, 23 How., 491..... 15
Panama R. Co. v. Napier Shipping Co., 166 U. S., 280 18
Piedmont, etc., Coal Co. v. Seaboard Fisheries Co., 254 U. S., 1 17
Rathbone Co. v. Champion, 189 Fed., 26 111
Richmond, The, 103 U. S., 540..... 15
Ripley v. Griffiths, 19 Rep. Pat. Cas., 590..... 41
Southern Ry. Co. v. Puckett, 244 U. S., 571..... 17
Stark Bros. Nurseries, etc., Co. v. Stark, 248 Fed., 154; 257 id., 9; 255 U. S., 50 108
Stuart v. Hayden, 169 U. S., 1.....15, 16
Truax v. Corrigan, 257 U. S., 312 22
Von Faber v. Faber, 124 Fed., 603..... 113
Walter Baker & Co. v. Gray, 192 Fed., 921..... 88
Westinghouse Co. v. Wagner Co., 225 U. S., 604 111
Wildcroft, The, 201 U. S., 378..... 16

Witnesses of Both Parties.

Respondent's Witnesses in Roman.

Petitioner's Witnesses in Small Caps.

	Page of Record.	Page of Brief.
Adams, Q. S.	243	90
Albright, E. R.	236	48, 93
Allen, C. F.	754	59
Allen, E. B.	342, 472	
Allen, Mrs. H. M.	463	
Ames, F. I.	216	90
Ames, W. S.	217	63, 88, 95
Arrington, H. S.	349	87, 90
Arrington, O. N.	208	91
Ashton, H. D.	789	91
Atkinson, F. C.	1114	
Barber, D. J.	260	90
Barnes, E. F.	179	63, 95
Bartlett, J. E.	741	
Beal, J. H.	1030	
Bell, S. H.	435, 945	92
Bell, W. R.	311, 966	
BERINGER, G. M.	1505, 1582, 1634	88
Bibbins, F. E.	824, 1168	
BLAIR, H. C.	1557	
Blodau, G. A.	105, 523	47, 93
BOESCH, T. K.	1549	
Bolden, W. L.	126	90
Bolenbaugh, J. E.	744	
Bond, J. B.	122	90
Bordeaux, C.	123	90
Bowden, R. D.	138	78
Bracy, S. V.	124	90
Briggs, C. H.	59	
Broussard, C. C.	134, 184	92
BROWN, E. R.	1403	51, 52, 100
Brown, H. H.	670	92
Bryant, W. J.	89	87, 90, 95
Burns, F. A.	170, 671	92
Burton, G. W.	321	90
Caspari, C. E.	1061, 1137	
Cavedo, W. S.	326	33, 90
Chestnutt, W. C.	147	91
Coleman, S. D.	298	92
Colvin, S. H.	235	90
Culver, J. W.	548	102
Cunningham, W. A.	282	87, 90
Daly, F. R.	256	87, 92
DE VALL, E. B.	1383	47, 62, 99
Dirmeyer	546	92
Dunham, D. B.	28	87, 91
Dunn, H. W.	475	92

	Page of Record.	Page of Brief.
Eberhardt, E. G.	7	
Edmondson, S. E.	639	104
Ege, C. H.	418	92
Eskridge, F. L.	375	91
Fancher, A. C.	265	88, 92
Ferguson, E. C.	152	91
Fisher, E. C.	324	91
Fitch, F. A.	193	90
Fly, A.	224	
Fort, L.	308	90
Foster, J. S.	151	90
Francis, J. M.	57	
Franklin, W. B.	304	90
Fritsch, H.	763	
FRITSCH, H.	1494	31
Fry, B. C.	141	91
Garber, A. B.	329	33
Garner, A. J.	377	50, 93
Garvin, W. S.	706	
Gilmer, B. B.	161	90
GONZALES, H. J.	1356	54, 63, 88, 98, 99
Gravel, C. F.	130	90
Green, F. E.	797	76
Greene, J. E.	505	91
Greene, R. H.	295, 963	90
Greil, T. T.	266	90
Gremillion, F. V.	129	91
Griffin, W. L.	162	92
Grigsby, R. L.	149	87, 90
Grimaldi, J. A.	750	
Groves, R. J.	358, 774	31, 66, 84
Haas, R. R.	71	92
HAFFA, G. A.	1546	
HAGAMAN, S. J.	1276, 1485, 1615	69, 70
Hamilton, S. R.	547	92
Hardy, L. B.	369	85
Hargrave, E. T.	351	91
Heim, W.	730	91
HELBIG, E. F.	1424	
Henckell, H. N.	87	91
Heno, C.	201	52, 93
Hereth, F. S.	352	
Hevenor, R. A.	72	90
Hilton, S. L.	1170	
Hooper, C. L.	15	82
Hoskins, W. D.	76	91
Howard, E. W.	951	
Howell, H. W.	262	91
Jacobs, E. G.	302	90
JAMES, H. E.	1542	
James, L. S.	925	106
Jennings, C. W.	92	87, 90
Jolly, W. A.	285	58, 88
JONES, B. F.	1325, 1610	48, 53, 64, 93, 96, 97, 98, 103, 104

	Page of Record.	Page of Brief.
Kelton, A. L.	94, 564	79, 105
KERSTANN, W. C.	1397	
Kessel, M. A.	734	
Kessel, O. H.	69	92
Kinder, J. A.	81	51, 93
King, F. M.	481	92
KING, J. D.	1260	
Knowles, A. F.	65	46, 87, 95
Knox, S. D.	125	91
Koellein, C. L.	104	90
Kuhn, D. J.	515	91
Lavison, G. A.	689	104
LAWALL, C. H.	1263	
Lebo, C. S.	429	92
Lilly, J. K.	42, 882	
Lindsay, W. S.	332	91
Lyle, H. W.	204	92
Lynn, C. J.	852, 935	45
Lyons, L. E.	190	90
McCambridge, J. E. (Sen.)	702, 833	
McCambridge, J. E. (Jun.)	847	
MCCARTHY, C. G.	1367	57, 66, 99, 103
MCCLELLAN, U. S.	1417	
McCorkle, R. E.	918	105
McMillan, O. J.	244	65, 95
MCNULTY, C. E.	1251, 1564	99
Manning, C. O.	109	48, 77, 93
Marshall, T. C.	305	90
Marten, G.	790, 931	
Martin, W. H.	54	92
Mayfield, O. S.	234	91
Merithew, W. M.	60	60, 95
MERNER, G. D.	1280	
Messenger, J. B.	90	92
Meyer, R. A.	725	
Moise, J.	641	104
MOON, V. M.	1462	59, 88, 98
Moore, J. J.	284	90
Moseley, J. M.	276	56, 87, 93
MULFORD, H. K.	1474	
Nelligar, F. D.	347	50, 93
Noiret, C. A.	406	95, 96
Northington, M. P.	264	90
NOTTINGHAM, S. J.	1452, 1575	59, 88, 98
Nowlin	673	
O'Connell	973	100
Odell	713	
Peabody, E. R.	445	
Pearson, C. F.	271	91
Perkins, A. J.	131	
Perrine, R. V.	658	76, 91
Persell, R. G.	194	90
PFEIFFER, G. A.	1195	86, 88
PFEIFFER, H.	1234	69, 73, 75, 85, 88

	Page of Record.	Page of Brief.
Pink, L.	30	51, 93
Porter, C. H.	172	
Powell, W. J.	681	91
Prochnow, J. R.	165	48, 93
Pumpelly, W. C.	301	91
Ramsey, F. M.	769	
Randolph R. L.	128	91
Ray, S. C.	210	53, 87, 93
Reid, J. B.	272	54, 93
Richard, V. B.	143	87, 95
RICHARDS, H. H.	1339	49, 50, 88, 95, 98
Ridenour, J. L.	319	90
Riley, J. B.	302	90
RITAYIK, H. J.	1301, 1613	99, 104
ROGERS, C. S.	1444, 1602	46, 95, 99
Roman, R.	53	90
SALB, O. G.	1421	
Samson, M.	187	87, 90
Sand, J. B.	103	90
Schaefer, W. A.	155	93
Schuh, H. W.	85	
Schuler, W. O.	162	92
Scott, W. M.	113	61, 95
Seeger, W.	665	91
Shepherd, E. S.	247	
Sinclair, A. H.	679	91
SMITH, C. B.	1560	
Smith, H. B.	443	92, 97
Smith, H. S.	171	54, 92
Soulier, A. L.	127	90
Spurlock, G. H.	153	91
STARBING, H. E.	1428, 1605	46, 61, 95, 99
STEVENSON, F. C.	1410	83
STONE, W. H.	1248	
Stovall, E. B.	233	
Stuckey, J. R.	558	103
Swift, E. G.	63	
Tague, J. R.	110	92
Thorburn, A. D.	31	
Thurman, C. J.	391, 806	71, 85
Tisdale, O. C.	248	92
Turner, G. H.	384	78
Van Schaak, C. P.	73	90
Van Dale, J.	720	92
Vaughan, A. L.	254	91
Vinson, J. H.	296	92
Walker, E. H.	258	91
Walker, G. W.	84	90
Walker, W. G.	540	102
Walsdorf, E. H.	205	87, 90
Watson, M. W.	773	92
Weber, J. H.	422	92
Weldon	1111	
Wetzel	335	92

	Page of Record.	Page of Brief.
Whidden	14	
White, E. H.	530	101
White, J. C.	649	91
Whiteley, J. F.	387	95, 96
WILKINS, J. W.	1314, 1643	96, 100, 102
Willis, M. R.	478	91
Wilson, J. E.	41	90, 100, 106
WILSON, J. F.	1621	88, 105
Winchester, R. L.	112	92
Winton, A. L.	1123	
Wolsey, J. N.	77	95
Wright, B. A.	68	47, 51, 92